Reviewer's report

Title: Columnar cell lesions of the canine mammary gland: pathological features and immunophenotypic analysis

Version: 3 Date: 30 October 2009

Reviewer: Gulisa Turashvili

Reviewer's report:

Minor Essential Revisions

1. Use consistent terms throughout the manuscript such as HER-2 vs Her-2, and Ki-67 vs Ki67.

2. Background: change 'characterized by varying degrees of acinar dilation in the TDLUs, lined by one, two or more make several layers of columnar epithelial cells' to 'characterized by varying degrees of acinar dilation in the TDLUs, lined by several layers of columnar epithelial cells'.

3. Background: change 'a clearer account of the alterations in canine mammary cancer will almost certainly lead to a better understanding of the key steps in the formation of human tumors' to 'a clearer account of the alterations in canine mammary cancer will help to better understand the key steps in the formation of human tumors'.

4. Methods: use plural 'mouse monoclonal antibodies' to list the primary antibodies.

5. Remove space from 'Tween 20 .', 'hyperplasia ( only 1 case without atypia)', 'tumors ( two benign...') .

6. Table 1: Add 'without atypia' to the first two columns, ie columnar cell change without atypia, columnar cell hyperplasia without atypia, and switch 'CCC with atypia' and 'CCH with atypia' columns.

7. Table 2. Change title to 'Types of canine mammary columnar cell lesions and associated neoplastic alterations.'

8. Table 3. Change title to 'Types of canine mammary columnar cell lesions and associated ductal hyperplasia in presence of different tumor types.'

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests