Reviewer's report

Title: Columnar cell lesions of the canine mammary gland: pathological features and immunophenotypic analysis compared with the human breast

Version: 1 Date: 3 June 2009

Reviewer: Eriko Tokunaga

Reviewer's report:

In this study, the authors investigated the columnar cell lesions (CCLs) of the canine mammary gland. The finding that CCLs of the canine mammary glands closely resemble CCLs in human specimens is interesting. They concluded that dogs are suitable model for the comparative study of noninvasive breast lesions; however, the scientific impact of this study is poor.

#1. The association between CCLs and coexistence of neoplastic lesions is not clear. Table 1 is difficult to understand.

#2. The importance of the immunohistochemical analyses, ER, PgR, 34#E-12, E-cadherin, Ki-67, HER2 and p53, is not clear.

#3. The author should describe the criteria of the positivity of Ki-67.

#4. The author should describe what kinds of benign lesions are included.

#5. The entire paper needs to be edited by a native English speaker.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.