Reviewer’s report

**Title:** High number of CD45RO+ tumor infiltrating lymphocytes is an independent prognostic factor in non-metastasized (stage I-IIA) esophageal adenocarcinoma

**Version:** 1 **Date:** 21 July 2010

**Reviewer:** Woo Ho Kim

**Reviewer’s report:**

The paper “High number of CD45RO+ tumor infiltrating lymphocytes is an independent prognostic factor in non-metastasized (stage I-IIA) esophageal adenocarcinoma” showed that high level of CD3+ and CD45RO+ TILs were associated with prolonged disease-free and overall survival in esophageal adenocarcinoma (Barrett’s cancer). Also, it showed the density of CD45RO+ TILs is an independent prognostic factor in non-metastasized (stage I-IIA) Barrett’s cancer patients and indicates an important role for the adaptive immunologic microenvironment.

Although the authors derived the positive result, there are several weak points in this study.

**Major Compulsory Revisions**

1. The findings shown here are not novel. There are many papers indicating the prognostic role of TILs in various types of cancer including esophageal cancer.
2. The number of subjects is too small to derive any conclusions in such a study using immunohistochemistry only.
3. It is necessary to describe the detailed method of determining cut-off points of various TIL densities.
4. Data presentation and description are poor in result section. Also, Table 1 and 2 are in need of modification.
5. Discussion section is too short and its contents are insufficient.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.