Reviewer's report

Title: Retrospective analyses of cisplatin-based doublet combination chemotherapy in patients with advanced gastric cancer

Version: 1 Date: 31 May 2010

Reviewer: Pompiliu Piso

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting paper on the effect of cisplatin based chemotherapy on advanced gastric cancer. In my opinion, some useful information can be taken from this manuscript to select appropriate patients for gastrectomy. The question is, however, what is really new in this paper? Platin derivates are in many countries standard for metastatic gastric cancer and, since MAGIC trial, they are used also in neoadjuvant treatment. The authors should focus on following aspects in the revised manuscript:

1. The inclusion of recurrent cancer in the group is problematic. The results should be treated separately and compared for primary advanced gastric cancer vs. recurrent cancer.

2. Why should be the prognosis better after gastrectomy? Is this true only for primary tumors? Should this suggest to perform always gastrectomy (to resect the primary tumor, even if asymptomatic)?

3. Did any patients had a curative gastrectomy following partial response?

4. Within patients with palliative gastrectomy, what was the reason to resect: bleeding, stenosis, other reason?

5. Within those having recurrent tumor, how many had received also neoadjuvant hemotherapy and did they had a responded?

6. How do the authors explain the higher response rate and improved PFS but no improvement of the OS? Is this difference relevant and why?

7. Has been the quality of life analysis?

8. Page 12, second row from bottom: it is the absence (not presence) of peritoneal dissemination

9. What about oxaliplatinum. It should be mentioned in the manuscript because it has lower toxicity with fewer cumulative adverse events than cisplatinum and a better PFS.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests'