Reviewer’s report

Title: Comparison of thymidine phosphorylase expression and prognostic factors in gallbladder and bile duct cancer

Version: 1 Date: 16 June 2010

Reviewer: era ji

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:

1. Why did the author choose the cell cycle regulatory proteins such as p53 and cyclinD1 and the anti-apoptotic protein, survivin? No significant differences were found in the expression of p53, cyclin D1, survivin, and ERCC1 between GB cancer and BDC. Why not choose others (k-ras, cerbB-2, bcl-2 and so on) to investigate molecular changes associated with the pathogenesis of biliary tract cancer? The authors have to clearly state that in the discussion and cite the appropriate literature.

2. “One hundred and sixty-one patients who underwent curative or palliative surgery for biliary cancer were evaluated.” “Immunohistochemical staining was performed on the sections of the tissue microarray blocks.” How many cases were included in the tissue array blocks? Why does the expression of p53, cyclinD1, survivin, TP and ERCC1 were detected in 127, 131, 129, 120, 113 cases irrespectively? (Table 2) This needs to be clarified and the correlation with survival data needs to be stated.

Minor Essential Revisions:

1. “Among all tumors on which immunohistochemical analysis was possible, 72 cases (56.7%) and 35 cases (26.7%) showed positive expression for p53 and cyclin D1, respectively, 54 cases (41.9%) for survivin, and 78 cases (65.0%) for TP. However, ERCC1 expression was mostly negative in 74 cases (65.5%).” “In Table 3. Immunohistochemical staining for tumors stratified by clinico-pathologic variables, the summary of T stage or differentiation of TP positive cases, P53 positive cases was not matched to the number list in text.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests