Reviewer's report

Title: Brain natriuretic peptide precursor (NT-pro-BNP) levels predict for clinical benefit to sunitinib treatment in patients with metastatic renal cell carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 24 August 2009

Reviewer: Christopher W Ryan

Reviewer's report:

MAJOR COMPULSORY REVISIONS

Table 1 - Provide the N in each group. Clarify whether "Mean fold change" at each time point is in relation to baseline. Baseline values: indicate if this is the mean value and provide a range or SD. Consider presenting timepoint data as absolute value rather than mean-fold change. Indicate whether the change from baseline at each time point is statistically significant.

Figure 1 - Provide the N in each group

Discussion - these preliminary observations do not establish NF-pro-BNP as a "surrogate marker" or as a predictive marker. More analyses, including multivariate analyses are needed. Please re-word

Discussion - Please add more discussion as to the proposed mechanism by which Nf-pro-BNP may act as a potential negative predictive marker

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

Yes - I have received honoraria from Pfizer, Bayer/ONYX, Wyeth, and Novartis
I have received research funding from Pfizer, Bayer, Novartis