Reviewer's report

Title: Radiation Therapy for Desmoplastic Medulloblastoma - A Retrospective Analysis of Outcome and Prognostic Factors

Version: 3 Date: 7 April 2010

Reviewer: Jacques Grill

Reviewer's report:

I still consider that the presence of pediatric cases in the review is problematic. The statement of the authors that desmoplastic medulloblastoma are identical in children and in adults is a misunderstanding. The only reference they cite about possible similarity goes back to 1997, a period where there was little knowledge about the biology of these tumors (Sonic Hedgehog pathway, specific genomic abnormalities such as 9q loss). I am not aware of any study or case report having in the recent years shown some biological similarities across age groups. Moreover and on the contrary to what the authors claim, desmoplastic medulloblastoma in children are more often in the vermis than in the hemisphere.

If the authors want to keep the children in their report, they should be more cautious about this cohort. The authors should know that in children this subtype is now considered to be chemocurable, ie that craniospinal irradiation can be avoided (see recent review and consensus statement by Rutkowski et al, in Pediatric Blood and Cancer). If they stick to their point of view, they should comment on that in the discussion since I do not think that my adult colleagues would accept this approach in adults.

For the rest of the manuscript, I have no problem with the modifications made.