Reviewer's report

**Title:** Prognostic Stratification Of Patients With Advanced Renal Cell Carcinoma Treated With Sunitinib. Comparison With The Memorial Sloan-Kettering Prognostic Factors Model.

**Version:** 2 **Date:** 25 November 2009

**Reviewer:** Matthew Galsky

**Reviewer's report:**

The patients included in this analysis included patients entered into a prospective database as of January 2008 - however, patients prior to this data were retrieved by their medical records and entered retrospectively. How were these patients identified - were all patients who received sunitinib during this time period included?

The final model consisted of two risk groups with statistically significantly different clinical outcomes. However, selection of this as the "best" model is largely the result of the small sample size and given the heterogeneity of patients with RCC, models that separate patients into more groups with disparate outcomes may be more helpful in clinical practice and for clinical trial stratification. The utility of the two-group model compared with models separating patients into additional risk groups should be discussed further and the small sample size contributing the selection of the final model should be discussed as a "limitation" of this analysis.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I have received fees from Pfizer for participating in their Speakers Bureau in the past.