Reviewer's report

Title: EpCAM Nuclear Localization Identifies Aggressive Thyroid Cancer and is a Marker for Poor Prognosis

Version: 1 Date: 21 January 2010

Reviewer: François Le Naour

Reviewer's report:

Following are my comments on the manuscript entitled “EpCAM nuclear localization identifies aggressive thyroid cancer and is a marker for poor prognosis” by Ralhan et al.

The manuscript is focused on the distribution of cleavage product of EpCAM especially the nuclear localization of Ep-ICD which is supposed correlated with aggressive thyroid cancers.

Although EpCAM is an exciting cancer marker, the manuscript exhibits insufficiencies.

- The pictures shown are two small for being really demonstrative of the membrane, cytoplasmic or nuclear localization. A higher magnification will greatly help the reader and therefore is needed.

- The correlation with beta-catenin is not convincible since there is a poor nuclear labelling. Most nuclei seem not stained.

- In the result section, text jumps from Fig1 to Fig3D; the number of figure is disorganized.

- In Fig1: the symbols M, C, N are not explicated in the legend to the figure; I guess it means membrane, cytoplasm and nucleus

- In the abstract: “Conclusion In conclusion…”, not really a good writing.

In conclusion, the manuscript can not be published in its present form.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.