Reviewer's report

**Title:** Adherence to Cancer Screening Guidelines Across Canadian Provinces: an observational study

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 18 January 2010

**Reviewer:** Brian Cox

**Reviewer's report:**

**Major compulsory revisions**

The paper needs to be rewritten in the past tense. All research and results are in the past. Some greater discussion about the accuracy of self-report of screening and its time since being screened is needed. This aspect of the results is dismissed lightly and overestimation of screening and its recency is likely to be a greater percentage of responses when actual screening is lower (e.g., at younger ages) than when higher (in guideline age groups). This would have the effect of reducing the differences the authors are examining. This really requires a comprehensive paragraph.

**Minor essential revisions**

Some discussion about the income gradient in guideline compliance in breast screening and the absence of a such a gradient in the organised Quebec programme is worthy of comment and, as it is in keeping with other research about the benefits of organised programmes, it adds some validity to the approach the authors have taken.

'though' should be through in last para of Statistical analysis.

The numbers of responses in the age groups being analysed by province should be given possibly in Table 2 by dependent variable.

The section under The role of Provincial Screening Programs needs to be clearer. I became a little confused because the first sentence seems to refer to breast screening but did not explicitly say so. Then, the sentence about prostate screening after mentioning screening in women seemed out of place.

**Discretionary revisions**

19.34 percentage points to 19.3%. The second decimal place suggests a level of accuracy that is probably not there.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.