Reviewer's report

Title: Methylthioadenosine (MTA) inhibits melanoma cell proliferation and in vivo tumor growth.

Version: 3 Date: 7 May 2010

Reviewer: Barry Nelkin

Reviewer's report:

Andreu-Perez et al present data indicating that high concentrations of methylthioadenosine (MTA) can inhibit melanoma cell growth, both in vitro and in vivo. Similar findings have been reported for other cancer types. This interesting finding suggests that MTA potentially may be considered as a component of a treatment strategy for melanoma.

Major compulsory revisions. The authors have responded acceptably to my critique.

Minor essential revisions.
1. Spelling and syntax errors remain. I mention a few: p.2 xenograph; p.3, MTAP gene should be The MTAP gene; "otherwise" should be deleted; p.6, "2ndary" should be "secondary"; DBA should be DAB; TUNEL should be capitalized; fluorescence
2. On page 8, the comparison of the cell cycle profiles +/- MTA treatment should be made clearer. It currently lists only the difference between treated and untreated, and it should instead report the actual values of the G1 cells in treated and untreated cells. (Discretionary -This might be best presented in a table, based on the data in Fig. 4E).

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests