Reviewer's report

Title: Induction of cytotoxic T lymphocytes primed with Tumor RNA-loaded Dendritic Cells in Esophageal Squamous Cell Carcinoma: preliminary step for DC vaccine design

Version: 1 Date: 16 January 2010

Reviewer: Andrew Chang

Reviewer's report:

Overall, the manuscript flows well and the experiments are well-described and outlined. Esophageal carcinoma remains a highly lethal malignancy with limited treatment options, particularly for the majority of patients who present with metastatic or inoperable disease. The development of a dendritic-cell vaccine would be an important advance in the treatment of this disease. In this submission, the investigators’ aim is to demonstrate that such a vaccine might be feasible immunologically.

Major Compulsory Revisions

No T-cell controls are provided. Consider repeating the RNA electroporation experiments using tumor-derived, normal and mock RNA electroporation into T cells isolated from healthy volunteers, to confirm that the authors' observations regarding CTL response are indeed tumor-specific.

Minor Essential Revisions

The figure labeling (1A) is unclear. In this experiment the investigators are seeking to demonstrate transfection efficiency using a GFP reporter, so would label panel A as Mock and GFP, rather than Mock and ESCC Patient. Were there sufficient DCs to determine the CTL response to GFP-electroporated DCs?

There are numerous errors in grammar and language usage

Discretionary Revisions

Consider deleting Figure 1B, or describing this panel further - e.g., is this a cytospin sample?

FACS analysis indicating a shift in FITC signal with the GFP-electroporated DCs is sufficient.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
I declare that I have no competing interests