Reviewer's report

Title: Inflammatory response associated with mammary carcinomas in female dogs: immunophenotyping of lymphocytes and the relationships between prognostic factors and survival rates

Version: 3 Date: 18 March 2010

Reviewer: Giuseppe Sarli

Reviewer's report:


The paper has been greatly improved in the revised version but I suggest acceptance only after the following points to be considered for further revision.

Major compulsory revision

• Methods, Histological classification and grade. Using this equipment, one high power field visualized an area of 0.239 mm2 (30-31). Does this mean that the references cited used the same your equipment?

• Results, Survival rates. The median survival is given when 50% of the members of a group die or have recurrence (this is a not correct definition of median survival). Only the metastasis group MC reached the median survival period (183.5 days) (whad does it mean? By definition when median time is calculated 50% of the cases must be above the median).

• Discussion. The panoramic analysis of a range of seric ................. relative percentages of CD4+T cells. Erase the sentences because it does not add information to support the discussion.

• Conclusion. On the other hand, the relative percentage of tumor infiltrating CD8+ T cells were important biomarker that was correlated with higher survival in days and absence of metastases ....... Please rewrite.

Minor essential revision

• Background, last paragraph. Aiming to understand the dynamic interaction the association between host ........... Please check for the readability. Aiming to understand the dynamic interaction between host...... or Aiming to understand the association between host....... or Aiming to understand the dynamic interaction and the association between host.........

• Methods, groups of animals. After euthanasia, the diagnosis was confirmed by complete histopathological analysis. I suppose histopathology after necropsy samplings so I suggest the following change. After euthanasia, the diagnosis was confirmed by complete necropsy and histopathological analysis.

• Methods, tumor samples. ......two groups: i) tumors measuring between 3-5 centimeters and ........ Does this mean that any tumours was lower than 3 cm.
Otherwise I suggest ….. two groups: i) tumors measuring up to 5 centimeters and 

- Discussion. …. there was high frequency of CD4+ T cells was observed in animals …….. Change in …. there was high frequency of CD4+ T cells in animals …… or …. high frequency of CD4+ T cells was observed in animals ……..

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests