Reviewer’s report

Title: Identification of an autoantibody panel to separate lung cancer from smokers and nonsmokers

Version: 3 Date: 9 February 2010

Reviewer: Caroline Chapman

Reviewer’s report:

The majority of the points made were addressed fully and satisfactorily.

The point re stating whether the protein was purified using native or denaturing technologies was not addressed as both come under the term 'according to manufacturers instructions'. Please include.

Details on the cancers was mostly included. However were the cancer samples taken at the time diagnosis, it is still not stated, if they weren’t how long after Dx were they taken?, and was the stage still the same?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: