Reviewer's report

Title: Genomic expression and single-nucleotide polymorphism profiling discriminates chromophobe renal cell carcinoma and oncocytoma

Version: 2 Date: 10 February 2010

Reviewer: Jason Herschkowitz

Reviewer's report:

Tan et al. pose the question of whether chromophobe renal cell carcinoma (chRCC) and renal oncocytoma, two closely related but clinically disparate entities, can be distinguished based on genomic profiling. They addressed all of my comments in the revised manuscript. Because the 14 probe-set signature derived using PAM was able to classify the tumors with 93% accuracy compared to a diagnosis based on histology, I asked the authors to address whether their test may be more accurate. They discussed the accuracy and the need to validate their findings in a large retrospective multi-center study. They corrected a discrepancy in the labeling of AQP6 IHC data in Table 4. The genomic data was placed into a publically available database to satisfy journal standards. Acknowledging the reviewers in the manuscript for our comments is appreciated.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests