Reviewer's report

Title: The Spectrum of Resistance in SR/CR Mice: the Critical Role of Chemoattraction in the Cancer/Leukocyte Interaction

Version: 3 Date: 17 February 2010

Reviewer: Ines Gütgemann

Reviewer's report:

Re Reviewer 1:
major comments
ad 3) please perform the experiment in the correct way to determine the true size of the "chemoattractant" in question, please also see last paragraph
ad 6) the second part of the comment was not addressed

Re: Reviewer 2
"It is not clear why the co-injection of tumors which does result in an infiltrate also controls the growth of another distinct tumor. Do the authors suspect a non-specific, antigen independent mechanism?"
"This is a major point in our paper.... As stated in the discussion on page 13, end of the first paragraph, ‘we cannot completely exclude the possibility that co-injection with S180 or CFAF also activates the effector mechanism of SR/CR leukocytes’, which would be a non-specific, antigen independent mechanism.."

This point is very important and should be clarified in the manuscript throughout the text and mentioned in the abstract. Since no in vitro migration studies were carried out by the authors and only in vivo endpoint studies were used to draw conclusions, the effects seen can either be explained by non specific activation of effector SR/CR leucocytes or by a true chemoattractant factor.

Re: page 8, last paragraph: "It was somewhat surprising that the resistance of SR/CR mice was so greatly reduced against some cancer cell lines compared to the exceptional resistance to S180 and EL-4 based on our in vitro assay results showing that all of these cancer cell lines could be killed [2, Z.C. unpublished results]. "

please correct semantic and grammatical errors

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.