Reviewer's report

Title: N-Acetylgalactosaminyltransferase-14 as a potential New Immunohistochemical Marker for Breast Cancer

Version: 3 Date: 11 December 2009

Reviewer: Gloria M Calaf

Reviewer's report:

Quantification of data by computer methods is needed

The authors claimed that GalNAc-T14 is a potential immunohistochemical marker associated with histological grade in breast carcinoma and tumor progression and that the enzyme has a significant association with invasive ductal type, mucinous adenocarcinoma and DCIS type carcinoma.

There is no statistic applied to conclude this statement. On the other hand, the manuscript has several contradictions in Results and Conclusions when data is properly analyzed in Tables and Figures. Example: Relationship between the proposed marker and Grade of tumors.

Figure 1 shows negative normal tissue in relation with the marker, but it seems like the authors did not use the antibody.

Figure 2B shows negative lobular carcinoma. It is a contradiction with conclusions and Tables

Figure 3: A, B and C. It is not clear whether the marker decreased or increased with malignancy or types of cancer.

Confusing results

Capitals letters are missing in several places in Tables. There is no consistency in this regard as well as spaces between words and the title

Table 1 Tumor stage

No results

Table 2 P value 0.00000: It is not clear

Table 3 N

Nothing under that line

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests’ below