Reviewer's report

Title: In vitro and in vivo anticancer properties of a Calcarea carbonica derivative complex (M8) treatment in a murine melanoma model

Version: 1 Date: 2 November 2009

Reviewer: Hua Wang

Reviewer's report:

In the present manuscript entitled "In vitro and in vivo anticancer properties of a Calcarea carbonica derivative complex (M8) treatment in a murine melanoma model", Dr. Edvaldo da Silva Trindade et al substantiated the role of M8 on melanoma model In vitro and in vivo. However, a number of issues need the authors' attention.

Major Compulsory Revisions:

1. Since the authors don't think C57BL/6 mice suitable for immunological questions study, they should use another animal model to confirm their experiments.
2. The authors didn't do any experiments that can support their conclusion (these findings suggest that this medication is a promising combination-therapy candidate).

Minor Essential Revisions:

1. The paper is poorly written and has many misquotes of literature results. For example: Page 7 line 11-12 "All in vitro experiments were performed at 37°C in a humidified atmosphere containing 5% CO2 during for 48 h."

Page 19 line 21-22 "it is the most used murine model to simulate metastatic melanoma because reflects several characteristics of human metastatic melanoma ."

2. What Y axis represents in Figure3, 7, 9, 10 is not shown.
3. Figure9: The SD is doubtful in "GR+"cells.

Discretionary Revisions:

1. In vitro reporter cells (MxRAGE7 and HT29-pNF-#B-hrGFP) experiments are missing. These experiments had nothing to do with cell adhesion or invasion.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.