Reviewer's report

Title: M1 form of tumor-associated macrophages in lung cancer is positively associated with survival time

Version: 1 Date: 31 January 2010

Reviewer: Peter Bradding

Reviewer's report:

This study has examined the distribution of CD68+ macrophages expressing the M1 marker HLA-DR and the M2 marker CD163 in the tumour islets and stroma of patients with NSCLC. Overall the study demonstrates that increased numbers of HLA-DR+ macrophages in the tumour islets and stroma are associated with improved survival. The study supports the view that “cytotoxic” M1 macrophages are involved in and tumour immune response.

Minor essential revisions:

1. There has been previous work in this area (Ohri et al) which is discussed in detail in the discussion but should also be acknowledged in the introduction. The results of the two studies give a similar message although there are some differences which are discussed satisfactorily.
2. Clarify whether formal ethical approval in place for this research?
3. Clarify how were the patients chosen for this study? Was there any potential for bias?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

Have published on the same subject area previously