Reviewer's report

Title: Dietary Fiber Showed no Preventive Effect from Colon and Rectal Cancers in Japanese with Low Fat Intake

Authors:

Shigeyuki S Nakaji (nakaji@srhajamaica.com)
Takashi T Umeda (nakaji@cc.hirosaki-u.ac.jp)
Tadashi T Shimoyama (TURE@cc.hirosaki-u.ac.jp)
Juichi J Sakamoto (nakaji@srhajamaica.com)
Shuji S Katsura (nakaji@srhajamaica.com)
Kazu K Sugawara (KSAGA@cc.hirosaki-u.ac.jp)
David D Baxter (nakaji@srhajamaica.com)

Version: 1 Date: 7 Jun 2001

Reviewer: Dr Richard Le Leu

Level of interest: A paper of considerable general medical or scientific interest

Advice on publication: Accept after revision, which I do not need to see

An interesting paper which has examined the effect of dietary factors in Japanese people who consume relatively low levels of fat.

Agree that a limitation of the study is the short time frame (10 years), as it is well known that colorectal cancer has a long latency period.

Minor points:

Page 5 (line 7) spelling error "lead" should be replaced with "led"

In tables "SMR" should be defined in the footnote. In table 2 intake of dietary fiber, energy, protein, fat and carbohydrate should be defined ie. g/day.

Would have been interesting to discriminate between the fat intakes, as omega-3 fats may have a protective effect against colorectal carcinogenesis.

Both protein and carbohydrate levels were measured, however why weren't any of these included in correlations.

Starch intake has been shown to be associated with colorectal cancer (Cassidy et al. 1994: Brit. J Clin Nutr. 69, 119-125.

It might be worth the authors examining starch correlations.

Major points:

Methods:
There is no mention about how the nutrients Vitamin A and Vitamin C were elucidated. Why not also include folic acid, as this nutrient is very topical.

In Table 3 the correlation coefficients are adequately defined for in the colon, however only fat is defined for the rectum. All Nutrients and food groups should be displayed for the rectum even if they are non-significant. This also applies to dietary fiber correlations for both the colon and rectum. Don't just display significant correlations.

**Competing interests:**

None declared.