Reviewer's report

Title: A randomized cross over trial of tolerability and compliance of a supplement with low iron separated from calcium vs high iron combined with calcium in pregnant women [ISRCTN56071145]

Version: 5 Date: 16 December 2005

Reviewer: Anwar T. Merchant

Reviewer's report:

General

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

It seems as if NVP was the main outcome of interest because the block randomization was done on whether or not it was present. If this was the case then constipation is a secondary outcome and should be presented as such. If there were other adverse outcomes considered such as headache ALL should be listed apriori because it is possible to observe a statistically significant association by chance due to multiple testing.

The months of gestation are not given or reported. Since gestational age may be related to the presence of adverse events (such as nausea) it is important to report any differences in the 2 groups at baseline and during follow-up.

The loss to follow-up was too large to be able to draw any valid conclusions. If the participants were dropping out because of one or other medication, the persons remaining in the study may have compliance rates that would be different from those who dropped out.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.