Reviewer's report

Title: Ethics, Gender Relations and Blood Safety: Women, Anti-D and the case for Fetal Genotyping Testing

Version: 2 Date: 20 January 2014

Reviewer: Kirstin Finning

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions
None

Minor essential revisions
1. 'Fetal Genotyping Testing' is not a recognised term. Fetal RHD genotyping is the correct term ('RHD' italicised).
2. Abbreviations are not explained in logical order throughout the paper; e.g. in the abstract the abbreviation 'Anti-D Ig' is used before the full written out version later in the paragraph. FGT is used towards the end of the paper, without an explanation of the term (see also above comment).
3. cffDNA testing for RHD first reported in 1998, not 1995.
4. Non Invasive Prenatal Testing of fetal Genotype section: the test identifies the genotype (not phenotype) of the fetus.
5. NHSBT is NHS Blood and Transplant (omit the word 'Service'). It would be more accurate to say England rather than UK, because the Scottish BTS have their own fetal RHD genotyping service.

Discretionary Revisions
6. Administration of anti-D Ig section, last line. Would be more accurate to say that HDFN due to anti-D cannot occur (sensitisation to other antigens is still possible).
7. Reference to the Dutch group work recommended to be added to ref 7.
8. It might be beneficial to emphasise the decisions made in Denmark and the Netherlands to offer fetal RHD genotyping to all RhD negative pregnant women; in Denmark the decision was made concurrently with the decision to implement RAADP, whereas in the Netherlands RAADP was already well established. The Danish paper also makes the observation that post-natal anti-D administration based on cord blood RhD phenotyping, held to be the gold standard, has a similar accuracy rate to fetal RHD genotyping, a point often disregarded when debating the risks of the ffDNA test.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

K Finning receives salary from NHS Blood and Transplant, an organisation which provides a fetal RHD genotyping service in England.