Reviewer's report

Title: Ethics, Gender Relations and Blood Safety: Women, Anti-D and the case for Fetal Genotyping Testing

Version: 2 Date: 15 January 2014

Reviewer: Edwin Massey

Reviewer's report:

Major essential revision
None

Minor essential revision
1. RAADP should be defined (routine antenatal anti-D prophylaxis). Page 3 under the heading "Administraton of Anti-D" line 7

2. Page 4 under the heading "Non Invasive Prenatal Testing of Fetal Genotype" The following sentence "In the UK fetal genotyping testing is currently only used when women have been referred to the NHS Blood and Transplant Service (NHSBT) for testing due to raised antibody levels or for other clinical reasons." Should, in my opinion, be changed to "In the UK non-invasive or invasive fetal blood group genotyping is currently only performed when womens' samples are referred to NHS Blood and Transplant (NHSBT) for testing to determine the risk to the fetus when a mother is known to have immune antibodies against the relevent blood group antigen."

3. On page 4 the authors state "A service implementation pilot that offers a fetal genotyping test to all RhD negative women is now underway in Bristol and Weston and results are expected in late 2014" but don't mention a larger NIHR project on which one of the authors was principal investigator. There may be good reason for this (confidentiality pending publication etc) but if not it would be worth alluding to the large centrally funded study as well as / instead of the local pilot.

4. Page 5 I think the following "We want to suggest that in the national audit of Anti-D Ig use in England by NHSBT a review of the ethical issues is also needed." Should be changed to "We want to suggest that in addition to the audit of Anti-D Ig use in England that is being undertaken by the Royal College of Physicians and NHSBT as part of their joint National Comparative Audit (NCA) program a review of the ethical issues is also needed."

Discretionary revision

1. A very minor point but I was always taught that sentences should not start with "However....." Page 3 under the heading "Administraton of Anti-D" line 5

2. I believe "fetal maternal haemorrhage (FMH)" should be "feto-maternal
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests. I do know one author professionally but I do not think that this affects my views of the article as most potential referees who can give an informed opinion would know one of the authors.