Reviewer's report

**Title:** Different sex ratios of children born to Indian and Pakistani immigrants in Norway

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 12 February 2010

**Reviewer:** Prahabat Jha

**Reviewer's report:**

Major revisions:

1. The Indian studies (see Jha et al, ref 8, and also http://www.censusindia.gov.in/Census_Data_2001/baseline/baseline2004.pdf for the RGI's 2004 report) finds that no differences (or minimal) among Hindus/Muslims living in India on CONDITIONAL sex ratios for 2nd or 3rd birth following earlier girl(s). That is, both religions used selective abortion. So why the difference between Pakistanis and Indians in Norway?

2. The numbers of births in Hindus is quite small so more caution in presenting these numbers is needed.

3. Page 8, line 187- No evidence that fertility rates are higher for higher order births (ref 8 and Mutharayyapa R in NHFS, Ref 2 in Ref 8 of this paper).

4. Ultrasound at 17-18 weeks means most women aborting would have late first trimester abortions- which is unusual. Do the researchers have any data on usage of such services?

5. Can the analyses be done not by total birth order but by conditional birth order (ie boy following girl birth)?

Changes need to be made to tone down the certainty of the conclusions. The numbers are small for births in Indians, so more cautious write up suggesting that these patterns have been seen would be wise.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

None