Reviewer's report

Title: The size of the treatment effect: do patients and proxies agree?

Version: 4 Date: 17 February 2009

Reviewer: Alessandra Solari

Reviewer's report:

The authors have addressed my major points, but I still have one comment:

When acknowledging the high attrition in the discussion section, the most important consequence of such limitation, i.e. selection bias, is not mentioned. The points cited (low study power, no subgroup analyses) are not pertinent to attrition, but to the small size of the study.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.