Author's response to reviews

Title: Significance of the parkin and PINK1 gene in Jordanian families with incidences of young-onset and juvenile parkinsonism

Authors:

Ronny Myhre (ronny.myhre@ntnu.no)
Stina Steinkjer (stina.steinkjer@gmail.com)
Alice Stormyr (alsto@hotmail.com)
Gina L Nilsen (gina.l.n@gmail.com)
Hiba A Zayyad (hiba_zayad@yahoo.com)
Khalid Horany (khalidhorany@hotmail.com)
Mohamad K Nusier (mick@just.edu.jo)
Helge Klungland (helge.klungland@ntnu.no)

Version: 2 Date: 14 September 2008

Author's response to reviews: see over
Author's response to reviews

Title:

Significance of the parkin and PINK1 gene in Jordanian families with incidences of young-onset and juvenile parkinsonism

Authors:

Ronny Myhre <ronny.myhre@ntnu.no>
Alice Stormy <alice.stormyr@medisin.uio.no>
Stina Steinkjer <stina.steinkjer@gmail.com>
Gina L. Nilsen <gina.l.n@gmail.com>
Hiba A. Zayyad <hiba_zayad@yahoo.com>
Khalid Horany <khalidhorany@hotmail.com>
Helge Klungland <helge.klungland@ntnu.no>
Mohamad K. Nusier <mick@just.edu.jo>

Date:

Sunday, 14 September 2008

Author's response to reviews: see over
The Biomed Central Editorial Team

Object:

MS: 1062425727154732 “Significance of the parkin and PINK1 gene in Jordanian families with incidences of young-onset and juvenile parkinsonism. “Myhre et al.

Thank you for consideration of our manuscript for publication in your journal.
We have reviewed the above manuscript according to your reviewer’s comments.

Reviewer#1
Title: Significance of the parkin gene in Jordanian families with incidences of early-onset and juvenile parkinsonism
Version: 3 Date: 15 October 2007
Reviewer: Alexis Brice
Reviewer's report:
General
The authors have appropriately dealt with my major comments.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
What next?: Accept without revision
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests: I declare that I have no competing interests.

Reviewer#2
Title: Significance of the parkin gene in Jordanian families with incidences of early-onset and juvenile parkinsonism
Version: 3 Date: 30 October 2007
Reviewer: Nobutaka Hattori
Reviewer's report:
General
This revised form is well written and the response is good. Therefore, I think that this is acceptable.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.

Reviewer#3
Title: Significance of the parkin gene in Jordanian families with incidences of early-onset and juvenile parkinsonism
Version: 3 Date: 10 October 2007
Reviewer: Jörg Epplen
Reviewer's report:
General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Unfortunately these authors appear resistant to my recommendations. Therefore, my statement remains 'sine qua non'.

**This is reviewers reply to our former difficulties with including as requested by the reviewer#3, quote:" Include PINK1 data". This has now been included in the manuscript. Due to this, major changes have been made to the manuscript in a manner too substantial to fully encounter. Originally being a Parkin gene investigation in the Jordanian material the manuscript had to be substantially altered to involve also the PINK1 gene according to rewiever#3’s request. The combination of results of the two genes, originally planned to be published separately in two original research articles, is now combined into one in every aspect, figure and sentence of the manuscript.**

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions
**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest  
**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published  
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.  
**Declaration of competing interests:**  
I declare that I have no competing interests  

We humbly hope for your acknowledgement of the magnitude of the request by reviewer#3 here undertaken and our unability to in detail account for the changes undertaken, and take this into consideration when evaluating our manuscript for publication in your journal.

Please contact me with future correspondence,
Sincerely Ronny Myhre