Reviewer's report

Title: The effect of coaching on the simulated malingering of memory impairment

Version: 3 Date: 11 May 2008

Reviewer: Robert McCaffrey

Reviewer's report:

Major Issues:

(1) This paper reports on yet another analog study on the effects of instructional sets on performance of symptom validity measures. Previous studies and literature reviews of other analog studies are not cited.

(2) The authors misuse of the term "malingering" is concerning. While acceptable in terms of the present study where the students were told to malingering neurocognitive impairments, in clinical practice this term is unacceptable because by definition it implies "intent" on the part of the examinee. Symptom validity tests measure an examinee's "level of effort." The clinician does not have "access" to the examinee's internal thought processes behind their observable performance on symptom validity tests.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.