Reviewer's report

Title: A questionnaire-based (UM-PDHQ) study of hallucinations in Parkinson's disease

Version: 1 Date: 10 March 2008

Reviewer: maria J marti

Reviewer's report:

This is a pilot study carried out to quantify the type and presence of hallucinations in Parkinson disease patients, proposing a new questionnaire.

It is a well and clearly written manuscript with proper methodology and well chosen references for discussion. The authors provided a broad and complete description of hallucination characteristics in a representative sample of patients.

There are, however, some points that should be addressed:

- In the results the authors say that “interestingly statin use was significantly more frequent in the non-hallucinator group”. Considering that it is an interesting point according to the authors, it would be important to discuss and justify the statement.

- In the text it is not clear whether the antidepressants were a cause or consequence of the more frequent distressing hallucinations. This is something that should be explained.

- They did not find differences in the MMSE score between hallucinators and non-hallucinators patients. Hallucinations have been reported to be a risk factor for incidental dementia. It would be of interest if they provide details about the duration of hallucinations. If they started recently then the finding would not be so unusual.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.