Reviewer's report

Title: Validation of the Cognitive Assessment of Later Life Status (CALLS) Instrument: A Computerized Telephonic Measure

Version: 2 Date: 9 May 2007

Reviewer: Angela H Gutchess

Reviewer's report:

General
In my opinion, the authors have adequately addressed the original reviewer’s concerns. The benefits of the new measure are contrasted with existing measures, particularly in terms of its length, ease of administration, potential benefits of collecting reaction time data, and relationship with specific subcomponents of cognition (vs. the relatively blunt MMSE). The authors have made an effort to validate the measure in diverse populations, and they note the need for further work in this area. The CALLS measure is not presented as a dementia diagnosis tool, although the potential to further develop the measure for these purposes is discussed later in the paper.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
None.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
None.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

I do have one suggestion. Being clearer at the beginning of the paper about the purpose of the screening test (for what uses it would be administered), may help to further motivate the measure. Initially the paper seems to suggest that assessing the incidence of dementia in the population is important. But the suggestion (p. 3) that the measure is not intended for primary care physicians made me wonder if the measure was primarily intended for identifying appropriate research samples, or for another purpose.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.