Reviewer's report

Title: A new approach: Valproic acid in Huntington's Disease. Dose dependent improvement of myoclonic hyperkinesia in a subgroup: retrospective analysis of eight cases

Version: 2 Date: 7 November 2005

Reviewer: Steven J Frucht

Reviewer's report:

General
This is an interesting and potentially important clinical observation on the use of valproic acid in myoclonic HD. There are several issues that need to be addressed.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Was this protocol sent to an institutional review board and approved? Was "informed consent" written as well as verbal? Were good clinical practice standards used?

Who rated the patients?

Were the dose and timing of other medications kept constant in the trial?

Please characterize the myoclonus further. What was its distribution, frequency, stimulus-sensitivity and physiology (back-averaging if done)? Was this presumably cortical myoclonus, subcortical or both? Was this likely positive myoclonus?

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.