Reviewer’s report

Title: Tai Chi and Vestibular Rehabilitation Improve Vestibulopathic Gait via Different Neuromuscular Mechanisms: Preliminary Report

Version: 3 Date: 3 November 2004

Reviewer: John Ludbrook

Reviewer’s report:

General
I shall address first the statistical matters that I dealt with in my comments, as Reviewer #3, on the previous version of the MS.

Statistical Analysis p. 10

Line 6: The Ryan-Holm stepdown Bonferroni procedure is a more accurate description (Ryan described it 20 years before Holm!). Also, I think you should give a reference (rather than the not very lucid examples in lines 8-12). You could even cite my paper to which I referred you in my last report.

Results

I recommended previously that you give raw p values, and adjusted p’ values. But in Results you give numerous p values without indicating whether they are p or p’ values. It would be a very good idea put both p and p’ in Table 1. And to add in other Tables that cover MEE and maybe trunk kinematics. This approach would allow you to do without the irritating multitudinous p values in the text, and merely refer to Tables.

Figure 3

My recommendation that you use least-products regression analysis, rather than least-squares was a counsel of perfection. You see, the Pearson product-moment correlation coefficient assumes that neither X nor Y values are fixed – the same holds for least-products regression. I shan’t insist!

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)