Reviewer's report

Title: Tai Chi and Vestibular Rehabilitation Improve Vestibulopathic Gait via Different Neuromuscular Mechanisms: Preliminary Report

Version: 2 Date: 11 June 2004

Reviewer: Gordon Taylor

Reviewer's report:

I am happy to accept the author's modifications to the paper and therefore happy to accept the paper for publication. However, there are still a couple of areas where I have concerns. They are as follows:

The authors reject the possibility of performing an analysis based on last value carried forward on the basis that it will reduce power. However, this also implies that the authors are not being conservative in their analysis and therefore are significantly increasing their chances of making a type I error and therefore seeing significant results that do not really exist. The results would be much more convincing if the authors performed a conservative analysis and still observed the significant results. However, I suspect as they are unwilling to undertake such an analysis that the significant results would no longer be present. I would therefore like to see better information for the reader on the limitations of this study and the generalisability of the results.

The paper is still inconsistent in the way it presents P values. I strongly disagree that it is not important to quote the exact P value when a P value is not significant. A P value of 0.06 clearly gives a very different message to P=0.68. However, they would currently both be presented as P>0.05! I am also unclear how writing P=0.68 rather than P>0.05 will significantly increase the number of words in the paper. I am however, happy for P<0.001 to be used where the P values are very small.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes

Declaration of competing interests:

None