Reviewer's report

Title: Prevalence of Abnormal Findings on Brain Magnetic Resonance (MR) Examinations Performed as a Part of an Annual Medical Check-up: Results of Brain Docking

Version: 1 Date: 30 May 2005

Reviewer: Frederik Barkhof

Reviewer's report:

General: Screening MRI is a hot topic, but the current manuscript adds very little, due to its relatively small size, lack of clinical follow-up (and gold standard), and the poor performance of MRA at the 1T system. Nevertheless, the findings may be noteworthy, especially for the Asian public.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions: One major shortcoming of the study (high FP rate of MRA) is discussed, the other (lack of clinical follow-up and thus underestimation of FN findings) need to be addressed. The conclusion in the abstract is too positive; the final conclusion of the discussion already somewhat better. Personally I think the conclusion is even more negative, since brain-docking may falsely suggest normalcy (FN rate currently unknown). Another major weakness is the fact that high WML grades are ignored, while they are a established risk-factor, e.g. for stroke.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests: no competing interests