Reviewer's report

Title: Confounding Factors In Diagnosing Brain Death: A Case Report

Authors:

Jeffrey M Burns (jburns@virginia.edu)
Ivan S Login (isl@hscmail.mcc.virginia.edu)

Version: 1 Date: 25 Apr 2002

Reviewer: Prof Michael Swash

Level of interest: A paper of considerable general medical or scientific interest

Advice on publication: Accept after discretionary revisions

Title: Confounding Factors In Diagnosing Brain Death: A Case Report
Journal: BMC Neurology
Reviewer: Prof Michael Swash, Department of Neurology, Queens Mary College (mswash@btinternet.com)

An interesting case

What was the outcome? The case report does not describe whether she survived or died, or whether the ventilator was turned off....
It is a cardinal criterion for the diagnosis of brain death that there should be no medical cause that might confound the diagnostic criteria - hypothyroidism is obviously one such disorder. The point is worth making again.
The authors should refer to the recent paper by Wijdicks in NEUROLOGY and the accompanying editorial. The criteria must be properly adhered to, and the discussion of the special tests applied in the USA do not necessarily apply in other countries.
The authors should consider the relevance of the brainstem death criteria used in the UK - hypothyroidism would invalidate their use.
A tragic case with brain injury associated with circulatory arrest even in the context of hypothyroidism and low core temperature.

Competing interests:

None declared.