Author’s response to reviews

Title: Islamic fasting and Multiple Sclerosis

Authors:

Soodeh Razeghi Jahromi (razeghi@razi.tums.ac.ir)
Mohammad Ali Sahraian (msahrai@sina.tums.ac.ir)
Fereshteh Ashtari (f_ashtari@med.mui.ac.ir)
Hormoz Ayramloo (ayromlouh@gmail.com)
Massoud Etemadifar (etemadifar.m@gmail.com)
Majid Ghaffarpour (ghafarpour@sina.tums.ac.ir)
Ehsan Mohammadiannejad (Ehsan_neuro@yahoo.com)
Shahryar Nafissi (s_nafissi@yahoo.com)
Alireza Nickseresh (nikar7@yahoo.com)
Vahid Shayeegannejad (shayegannejad@med.mui.ac.ir)
Mansoreh Togha (oghae@sina.tums.ac.ir)
Hamid Reza Torabi (drhamidtorabi@yahoo.com)
Shadi Ziaie (shadi_z73@yahoo.com)

Version: 2
Date: 21 February 2014

Author’s response to reviews:

Dear Reviewers

Thank you very much for your valuable comments and detailed appraisal which leads to a more qualified manuscript. Here are the responses to your valuable comments.

Reviewer: 1

The papers is not fluently written and contains a number of English errors which need to be rectified.

We edited the paper for grammatical errors and typos and highlighted the changes in this revised manuscript.

None of these authors as I can see is an expert on nutrition and they need to have a nutritionist on board to add some more scientific input to this discussion.

The first author (SRJ) is a nutritionist and we add some new input from her to the discussion part.

I strongly recommend that they avoid using terms such as "experts recommend this or that ..." which refers to themselves and they should simply say that "it is recommended.

The terms such as “ experts recommend….“ Have been deleted or changed from this revised manuscript.

They need to look at the ketogenic diet and epilepsy and use that as a model for
their paper and see how changing diet can affect the severity of a neurological
disease.
We use some of the data of ketogenic diet and epilepsy and added them in the
manuscript.
The authors say that multiple sclerosis is a complex syndrome. This is totally
wrong and multiple sclerosis is a disease and not a complex. This must be
corrected
This has been corrected.
The format of the paper is odd and they need to avoid any interruptions in the
fluidity of the text and instead write and fluent paper and avoid the term debate.
We changed the manuscript according to this comment and avoided the term
debate as much as possible.
The discussion is written in a rush and the authors need to use more references
of the role of calorie restriction and the function of the immune system. How does
keeping someone hungry and dehydrated affects his/her immune system
function. This is the core of the paper which is totally missing.
This part has been added to the discussion part.
The conclusion of the paper leaves the reader nowhere and a reader cannot
draw any conclusion as whether a person with multiple sclerosis can fast or no.
This needs to be addressed more robustly
This is still a controversial issue and we tried to say that patients with MS can go
on fasting according to their clinical situation and conditions. Fasting is not
prohibited for all patients with MS and cannot be permitted in all of them. We
tried to conclude that MS patients can go on fasting according to their clinical
situations. We changed the conclusion part with better remarks and more robust
sentences.
Reviewer: 2
Thank you for your positive feedback.
The quality of English writing was improved.
The data of the recommended article was used and we add this reference No. 30