Reviewer's report

Title: Relation between aphasia and arcuate fasciculus in chronic stroke patients

Version: 3 Date: 4 December 2013

Reviewer: Prakash Paliwal

Reviewer's report:

Following are major compulsory revisions needed.
1. In discussion author has tried to explain why FA value of the left AF does not correlate with language function but no explanation has been given for negative correlation for ADC values of left AF with language function.
2. Additional advantage of doing Korean MMSE over Korean-Western aphasia battery is not clear and also it is not clear whether results of Korean MMSE were confounded by speech difficulty.
3. In Type A pattern as shown in figure on MRI patient is having a large Left MCA territory stroke with involvement of even Broca’s and Wernicke’s areas so low score on Aphasia quotient is expected and may be confounded by other areas involvement. This confounding effect has not been discussed and explained in the paper.

Following minor essential revisions are needed.
1. In type A pattern for left AF on DTT authors have not analysed DTT parameters reason for which should be make clear in discussion for clarity.
2. There are language errors and mismatch of results in Text and table 1.
   i.e.
   a. In table 1 in type A total 6 patients with male: female 4:2 but in text in results section line 3 it is mentioned as 3 males in that group. Also in table 1 in type C total 8 patients but ratio showing 5:5 which should be corrected to 4:4 as per text.
   b. In discussion section second para line 5 "the next year" need to be corrected

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests