Reviewer’s report

Title: Relation between aphasia and arcuate fasciculus in chronic stroke patients

Version: 3 Date: 26 November 2013

Reviewer: LEONARD YEO

Reviewer’s report:

This is an interesting study and it gives insight into the relationship between aphasia and an intact arcuate fasciculus.

I have a few comments:

The author should define what is type A, B and C in the abstract if they include it in the abstract.

Although the correlation was significant, nonetheless at r = 0.471 the correlation between the aphasia quotient and voxel number is weak and this may not be clinically significant. I feel that the authors would also be hard-pressed to describe that there is a close relationship between the 2.

Although the AQ for type A is better than type B and type B is correspondingly better than type C, this may not be easily attributable to the AF. Type A has a much larger volume of infarct than type B and type C, on the scan provided it appears that it involves the wernicke’s area as well. Other areas that are affected by the stroke could similarly account for this difference in AQ. While I understand it is difficult to control for this, similar stroke types with similar affected areas leaving only the AF different would be ideal.

also without a preceding MRI, how do the authors know that there are no previous infarcts and that the patients do not have any asymptomatic strokes. The educational level of the patients are not controlled as well, neither is the infarcted areas excluding the AF. Basically the patients may not start from the same baseline state.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests’