Reviewer's report

Title: Subarachnoid hemorrhage secondary to a ruptured middle cerebral aneurysm in a patient with osteogenesis imperfecta: A case report

Version: 2 Date: 19 March 2014

Reviewer: Koji Takano

Reviewer's report:

This case report describe a rare case of cerebral aneurysm in a patient clinically diagnosed as osteogenesis imperfecta, a connective tissue disorder due to mutated type 1 collagen. This case suggest that the etiology of aneurysm in this patient is due to the malfunction of collagen fiber known in osteogenesis imperfecta. I regard this case report be published in the Journal because it provides a deep insight into the pathogenesis of cerebral aneurysm.

However, I have several minor comments.

1. Please describe that genetic analysis did not reveal any mutation in COL1A# gene and COL1A2 gene in the abstract and in the case presentation.

2. The conclusion had better be related to the important finding of this case. For example:

We experienced a case of SAH secondary to ruptured saccular intracranial aneurysm in a patient with clinically diagnosed OI. Although mutation in COLA1 or COL1A2 gene was not detected, it is clear that this patient is clinically OI. There may be some causative relationship between the two diseases because there are several reported cases of cerebral aneurysm in patients with OI.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests in relation to this paper.

Koji Takano, MD, Ph.D