Reviewer’s report

Title: Symptomatic Hyponatremia after Lateral Medullary Infarction

Version: 5 Date: 31 March 2014

Reviewer: neal rao

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:

The authors’ revisions are insightful, and this remains a very interesting case. In particular, the sodium and volume disturbances that the patient experienced in association with a lateral medullary lesion are important observations to report. However, the proclamation that this patient's hyponatremia was "due to initial SIADH followed by CSW" is not adequately supported. From the evidence presented, we cannot confirm that the patient's initial volume status and sodium level were in fact due to inappropriate ADH secretion, as opposed to an entirely different entity or a combination of factors including CSW. As the there was no direct test of ADH performed, and the underlying etiology of the sodium/volume fluctuations is still a matter of speculation, I would strongly recommend against asserting that the patient “experienced symptomatic hyponatremia due to initial SIADH followed by CSW.”

In light of the uncertainties regarding the etiology, the background and case presentation should be limited to the objective findings. The diagnoses of possible SIADH and CSW should be moved to the discussion, and placed in context of the theoretical etiologies of the sodium fluctuations seen in this patient.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests