Reviewer's report

Title: Clinical correlation of subcortical gray matter alterations of MRI-negative neocortical epilepsy

Version: 2 Date: 12 February 2014

Reviewer: Aidan Neligan

Reviewer's report:

In this study the authors compare gray matter alterations in people with neocortical epilepsy compared to controls.

I have several issues with the paper.

1. The introduction is poorly structured and does not give a succinct rationale for this study. In particular the authors do not provide any explanation why the 7 sub-cortical areas chosen for analysis were selected. Similarly the clinical correlation with the selected areas is not explained.

2. The statistical analysis needs a separate section and the methodology needs to be clearly outlined.

3. The results section is poorly presented and needs to be more coherently summarised. Similarly the statistical p-values should be included.

4. My main concern is with the discussion as the clinical implications or indeed the pathogenesis of the identified abnormalities is not clearly. Similarly the authors compare previous imaging findings in different epileptic syndromes simultaneously and I think these would be better discussed in sequence.

5. The grammatical structure of the paper is very poor and needs considerable revision.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.