Reviewer’s report

Title: West syndrome followed by juvenile myoclonic epilepsy: a coincidental occurrence?

Version: 1 Date: 26 November 2012

Reviewer: Athanasios Covannis

Reviewer's report:

The authors present a case of infantile spasms, successfully treated who at the age of twelve developed myoclonic jerks with good response to levetiracetam.

My comments

• Author the presenting history prior to spasms and the evolution after a successful treatment does not indicate idiopathic infantile spasms (Covanis A. Epileptic Encephalopathies (including severe epilepsy syndromes). Epilepsia, 53 (Suppl. 4): 114-126, 2012)

• The definition of a syndrome must involve more than just seizure type. Therefore a child may have myoclonic jerks or typical absence seizures that do not constitute the syndromes JME or CAE respectively. A syndrome is defined by specific clinical and EEG characteristics that cluster together.

• In the text you state that during follow-up the neurological examination was normal. I suspect you mean that the child did not have gross neurological deficits.

Author the case you present has “probably symptomatic”–symptomatic (? genetic) etiology and its evolution is mainly due to the underlying pathology. Symptomatic or probably symptomatic cases may have myoclonus and a few may respond to appropriate treatment.

A suggested title of your paper is: West syndrome followed by myoclonic seizures in adolescence.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.