Reviewer’s report

Title: EIF4G1 gene variants are not associated with Parkinson’s disease in the ethnic Chinese population

Version: 1 Date: 14 October 2012

Reviewer: Owen Ross

Reviewer’s report:

The article of Li et al. describes a study on the role of EIF4G1 variation in PD patients from China. The authors screen a small series of late-onset patients with apparent autosomal dominant pattern of inheritance. They then screen a larger case-control series for three variants, of which two are not observed. This is a relatively small study but adds data to the field.

• The authors should highlight that their samples are not typical late-onset cases but most are early-onset with an average age –at-onset 50 years.
• The authors should run the other reported EIF4G1 variants in PD, and a set of tagging SNPs if they want to conclusively say there is no association with disease in their population. The authors should highlight that the 3614G>A is the original R1205H.
• In the Background the authors refer to PD genes and highlight ATP13A(2) and PLA2G6 (which don’t cause PD) but don’t report PINK1 or DJ-1.
• The authors could shorten their manuscript, the first two paragraphs of the discussion is a repeat of the introduction, Tables 3 and 4 could be supplemental if needed and Figure 1 is unnecessary.
• The authors should provide the primers that were used as supplemental or reference the study they got them from if not original.
• The authors should have a native English speaker check the language and grammar.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.