Reviewer’s report

Title: Exome sequencing identifies titin mutations causing hereditary myopathy with early respiratory failure (HMERF) in families of diverse ethnic origins

Version: 1 Date: 14 November 2012

Reviewer: Ichizo Nishino

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
1) Conclusion in Abstract: the last sentence lacks concrete contents.
2) Discussion: There is no “sporadic inclusion body myopathy”. It should be “inclusion body myositis”. For hereditary inclusion body myopathy, now the new term “GNE myopathy” is recommended to avoid such confusion between IBM and HIBM that are completely different disease entities.
3) Adult-onset Pompe disease should be included as a differential diagnosis because patients can show respiratory insufficiency in early stage and cytoplasmic inclusions can be seen in skeletal muscle fibers, which could be similar to HMERF (Neuromuscular disorders 2012; 22: 389-393).

Minor Essential Revisions
1) Muscle biopsy of Methods section: “family A,” ” family B,” and “family C” appeared abruptly. Probably, families A-C should be indicated in the corresponding part in Background.
2) Discussion: Most of the first paragraph could be moved to Background.

Discretionary Revisions
None.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.