Reviewer's report

Title: Incidence of first ever stroke during Hajj ceremony

Version: 7 Date: 6 August 2013

Reviewer: norberto I cabral

Reviewer's report:

The incidence of first ever stroke during Hajj ceremony

Dear authors

Major concerns
To compare incidence between two populations you need to adjust the crude incidences to a standard population. Please, do it to Iran and World population all over the manuscript.

So, in table 2, you reported a crude rate of 18 (10-26) in Hajj subjects and 12 (5-19) in MSIS subjects (p=0.273). You need to calculated and show the 95% CI in adjusted rates in both populations and then the p value.

Please note that your conclusion of lower incidence in the Hajj cohort is not reliable yet. For age and genders subgroups, the comparisons need to be done only after adjustment. Do not calculate p value between crude rates from different populations. Please, fix these concerns all over the manuscript.

An incidence rate is ratio between number of cases (numerator) and population at risk (denominator). So, please insert “n” column before population in the tables 2 and 3.

Minor concerns
Abstract: Background...incidence of first ever stroke; Next line: ... first ever stroke

In stroke epidemiology, CVST are not included with ischemic strokes. The anatomy, physiopathology, risk factors and prognosis are completely diverse. The indication or not of oral contraceptive are not related to your methods. As I told before, please, exclude the CVST cases.

All the best

Norberto Cabral

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

No disclosures