Reviewer's report

Title: Incidence of first ever stroke during Hajj ceremony

Version: 4 Date: 11 March 2013

Reviewer: Giancarlo Logroscino

Reviewer's report:

Are there any data suggesting the completeness of ascertainment in this pilgrim group?

Any data in the literature presenting the risk for stroke and MI in subjects attending religious or other type of events involving big crowds?

The pilgrims come from all Iran while the comparison group is from the city of Mashhad. Is it reasonable to assume that the risk is similar in the whole Iran to the risk of the residents of Mashhad?

In the discussion the authors suggest that a screening program similar to the screening program implemented for the Haji ceremony could be tested. The goal of the screening program is to select the more fit for the pilgrimage, a special event. How does this program could be comparable with screening programs in the general population in normal setting?

Should the authors discuss the possible link of their findings with the healthy migrants effect?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.