Author’s response to reviews

Title: Incidence of first ever stroke during Hajj ceremony

Authors:

mahmoud reza azarpazhooh (azarpakhoohmr@yahoo.com)
Reza Bavarsad Shahripour (nbavar@yahoo.com)
Moira Kapral (Moiralkapra@dentistry.utoronto.ca)
naghmeh mokhber (nmokhber@yahoo.com)
ali shoeibi (ashoeibi@yahoo.com)
mohammad taghi farzadfard (farzadfardmt@yahoo.com)
mohammad reza rafati (rafatimr@yahoo.com)
amanda thrift (amanda.thrift@monash.edu)
seyed Aidin sajedi (drsajedi@gmail.com)
Amir Azarpazhooh (amir.azarpazhooh@dentistry.utorono.ca)

Version: 4 Date: 22 December 2012

Author’s response to reviews: see over
Dear Deesha,

Hope all is fine, please find attached the revised manuscript that would address your questions below. Here are the responses point by point:

Please could you state in the Methods section whether written informed consent for participation in the study was obtained from participants or, where participants are children, a parent or guardian.

Please note this research is a secondary data analysis, the database was de-identified by Hajj organization before being released to our team. Therefore, there was no direct recruitment of participants to this study hence there is no indication for the statement of consent.

We also need further clarification regarding ethics. You say in your manuscript that: "The study was approved by the Ethics Committee of the Hajj and Pilgrimage Organization of Iran." However we cannot see any record of this being an actual medical ethics committee. Please can you send us the original proof of ethics document given by your ethics committee. If this is not in English then you would also need to send us an official translated copy. This would need to be on headed paper and signed by an official contactable person.

Please find attached the approval letters from Iranian Red Crescent Society as well as Mashhad University of medial Sciences.

Lastly we note that you previously submitted this manuscript to BMC Neurology but it was later withdrawn. Can you kindly confirm that this manuscript is currently not under consideration at any other journal.

The paper is not currently under consideration at any other Journal, we elected not to submit this paper to the BMC Public Health as we consider BMC Neurology to be a better venue for this research.

We hope you are satisfied with these answers and you are now able to initiate the review process. We are looking forward to the reviewers comments as we believe it is only through thoughtful and constructive criticism that the quality of this paper will be improved.

Best wishes for a happy new year.
Reza