Reviewer's report

Title: A New Method to Retrospectively Study the Hemodynamic Changes before and after Aneurysm Formation in Patients with a Ruptured or Unruptured Aneurysm

Version: 2 Date: 15 September 2013

Reviewer: Wenguo CUI

Reviewer's report:

(1) Major Compulsory Revisions
1. Detailed description of computational fluid dynamics analysis should be reduced and simplified, as the BMC Neurology is a neurological journal and most of the readers are neurologists.
2. Conclusion of this study should be rewrite as the main of this study was to compare hemodynamic changes between a runptured and unruptured aneurysm.
3. Remove the aneurysm sac from parent artery was only partial simulate a status before aneurysm generation, from geometric and hemodynamic aspects, but aneurysm formation may involve many complicated mechanisms, the authors should discuss limitations of this technique.

(2) Minor Essential Revisions
1. Geometric comparison discussion should be reduced, since only two human models comparison could be meaningless. More importantly, the main focus of this study was hemodynamic analysis comparison as you have stated in your title.
2. Figure 6 and 7 could be merged to reduce the figure number.

(3) Discretionary Revisions
None

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.