Reviewer’s report

Title: Development and external validation of a new PTA assessment scale

Version: 1 Date: 4 May 2012

Reviewer: Sandrine de Ribaupierre

Reviewer’s report:

Interesting article.

Major revision:

- it should be made clearer how and when the tests were administered to the patients, because I don't understand how there can be results in the severe TBI (GCS <8) for any of the PTA test, as per definition those patients are in a coma!

I suspect that they have a GCS <8 when they arrive but might get better within the first 24h; however I believe that is not clear in the manuscript and needs to be clarified. The exact timing of the test compared to the arrival of the patient in hospital as well as an idea of how fast the patient improved is important.

For moderate and severe TBI, when was the GCS assessed, and was a low GCS score given because of secondary issues (seizure, meds?) which would explain why the patients were then able to answer appropriately to the test within 48h?

There is also a bias within the education between the different groups (especially with the severe TBI, which cannot be corrected, but maybe could be explicitly stated with its implication)

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.