Reviewer's report

Title: Development and external validation of a new PTA assessment scale

Version: 1 Date: 2 May 2012

Reviewer: Teneille Gofton

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript describes the development and validation of a novel tool for assessment of post-traumatic amnesia following traumatic brain injury. It is of interest to those practicing in the field of neurology, neurosurgery, emergency medicine and general family medicine. Overall, the manuscript is written in a clear and concise manner.

Minor revisions:

1. A concern is the difference in the distribution of patients with varying severity of TBI in both the derivation and validation stages of the study. The vast majority of patients fall into the mild TBI group, with only 20% (approximately) of the patients falling into the moderate or severe TBI groups. This begs the question: how applicable is this PTA assessment tool for patients with moderate or severe TBI. It may be beneficial to validate the data in a larger cohort of patients with moderate to severe TBI.

2. Paragraph 2, page 5. Re remembering the examiner’s name. The portion of the sentence in this section may be better suited to brackets. Currently, it is difficult for the reader to understand without reading the sentence multiple times.

Major revision:

3. I am surprised that the institutional review board waived any requirement for consent to participate in the study. Could this be verified?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.