Author's response to reviews

Title: Cognition after malignant media infarction and decompressive hemicraniectomy

Authors:

Holger Schmidt (H.Schmidt@med.uni-goettingen.de)
Trutz Heinemann (info@lichtenau-ev.de)
Judith Elster (judith.elster@googlemail.com)
Marija Djukic (mdjukic@gwdg.de)
Stefan Harscher (s.harscher@klinikum-weimar.de)
Katja Neubieser (katja.neubieser@gmx.de)
Hilmar Prange (hprange@gwdg.de)
Andreas Kastrup (andreas.kastrup@klinikum-bremen-mitte.de)
Veit Rohde (veit.rohde@med.uni-goettingen.de)

Version: 5 Date: 9 June 2011

Author's response to reviews: see over
Point to point revision for “Cognition after malignant media infarction and decompressive hemicraniectomy – a retrospective observational study”

Reviewer Tibo Gerriets:

…it should be mentioned that handicapped patients have disadvantages in their alertness and concentration compared to a healthy control group. We mentioned in the methods section this phenomenon and have now added that for this reason, we carried out the tests for the domain attention at an early time of day.

In our opinion it is still unfortunate that the study cannot provide data about conventionally treated patients as they were not available. This is true. We tried to provide such a group but we were just not able to. Therefore this work only claims to describe the situation after DCH. We cannot provide a cognitive comparison between a conservatively and a surgically treated group.

A problem remains the variance of the time...

We have now added a phrase in the discussion section stating that because of the high variance of the interval between stroke and re-examination, the data should be interpreted cautiously.

... do they mean: does not indicate that depression was the primary factor? The „not“ has been inserted.

Reviewer: Eric Jüttler

... I think you mean "nursing home" instead of "nursery home"

Nursery has been replaced by nursing.

Layout: The information on the title page has been shortened. The tables have been integrated into the main text, vertical lines have been removed.

The document has been once again read and revised by a native American speaker (Ms. C. Bunker)